



Common Sense Initiative

Mike DeWine, Governor
Jon Husted, Lt. Governor

Joseph Baker, Director

Business Impact Analysis

Agency, Board, or Commission Name: Ohio Environmental Protection Agency

Rule Contact Name and Contact Information:

Mandi Payton, Agency Rule Coordinator Amanda.pavton@epa.ohio.gov

Regulation/Package Title (a general description of the rules' substantive content):

Water Quality Standards – no change beneficial and wetland use designations

Rule Number(s): 3745-1-29, 3745-1-30, and 3745-1-53

Date of Submission for CSI Review: _____

Public Comment Period End Date: _____

Rule Type/Number of Rules:

New/____ rules

No Change/ 3 rules (FYR? Y)

Amended/____ rules (FYR? ____)

Rescinded/____ rules (FYR? ____)

The Common Sense Initiative is established in R.C. 107.61 to eliminate excessive and duplicative rules and regulations that stand in the way of job creation. Under the Common Sense Initiative, agencies must balance the critical objectives of regulations that have an adverse impact on business with the costs of compliance by the regulated parties. Agencies should promote transparency, responsiveness, predictability, and flexibility while developing regulations that are fair and easy to follow. Agencies should prioritize compliance over punishment, and to that end, should utilize plain language in the development of regulations.

Reason for Submission

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

1. **R.C. 106.03 and 106.031 require agencies, when reviewing a rule, to determine whether the rule has an adverse impact on businesses as defined by R.C. 107.52. If the agency determines that it does, it must complete a business impact analysis and submit the rule for CSI review.**

Which adverse impact(s) to businesses has the agency determined the rule(s) create?

The rule(s):

- a. ☐ **Requires a license, permit, or any other prior authorization to engage in or operate a line of business.**
- b. ☐ **Imposes a criminal penalty, a civil penalty, or another sanction, or creates a cause of action for failure to comply with its terms.**
- c. ☐ **Requires specific expenditures or the report of information as a condition of compliance.**
- d. ☐ **Is likely to directly reduce the revenue or increase the expenses of the lines of business to which it will apply or applies.**

These rules do not have an adverse impact on business as defined in Section 107.52 of the Revised Code. It is the practice of the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency to file all rules with the Common Sense Initiative Office for evaluation under this statute.

Regulatory Intent

2. **Please briefly describe the draft regulation in plain language.**

Please include the key provisions of the regulation as well as any proposed amendments.

Under the Clean Water Act (CWA) states are required to have water quality standards that protect lakes, rivers, streams or other surface waters from pollution. Ohio's water quality standards are in OAC Chapter 3745-1. The required components of a water quality standard include: beneficial use designations; narrative and numeric criteria protective of the use designations; and implementation procedures used to evaluate decisions that could result in the lowering of water quality (referred to as the antidegradation policy or rule).

Water quality standards are then used in other CWA programs such as the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit program, the Section 404 and Section 401 water quality certification program and the establishment of Total Maximum Daily Loads (TMDLs). Any impacts to the business community are realized only through the implementation of water quality standards in these other regulatory programs.

Beneficial use designations are the water quality goals for lakes, rivers, streams and other water bodies. Designations include such uses as aquatic life habitats (warmwater, coldwater, etc.), recreation (bathing waters, primary contact, secondary contact) and water supplies (public, agricultural, industrial).

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

Beneficial use designations are assigned to specific water bodies in OAC Chapter 3745-1. Each of the 23 major drainage basins or watersheds in the state is assigned a rule in the chapter. This rulemaking addresses the use designation rules for the following two drainage basins: Wabash River (3745-1-29) and Mill Creek (3745-1-30). No changes are being considered at this time.

Rule OAC 3745-1-53 contains the wetland beneficial use designation assignment. No changes are being considered to this rule.

3. Please list the Ohio statute(s) that authorize the agency, board or commission to adopt the rule(s) and the statute(s) that amplify that authority.

The Ohio statute authorizing these rules is Ohio Revised Code 6111.041, and for rule 3745-1-53, 6111.12 also applies.

4. Does the regulation implement a federal requirement? Is the proposed regulation being adopted or amended to enable the state to obtain or maintain approval to administer and enforce a federal law or to participate in a federal program?

If yes, please briefly explain the source and substance of the federal requirement.

Yes, these regulations implement federal requirements in the Clean Water Act and Title 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Parts 131 Water Quality Standards and 132 Water Quality Guidance for the Great Lakes System.

5. If the regulation implements a federal requirement, but includes provisions not specifically required by the federal government, please explain the rationale for exceeding the federal requirement.

Not applicable. These rules do not exceed federal requirements.

6. What is the public purpose for this regulation (i.e., why does the Agency feel that there needs to be any regulation in this area at all)?

The CWA section 303(c)(2)(A) requires that water quality standards protect “public health or welfare, enhance the quality of the water and serve the purposes of [the Act].” The CWA section 101(a)(2) establishes as a national goal “water quality which provides for protection and propagation of fish, shellfish, and wildlife, and recreation in and on the water, wherever attainable.”

The value of clean water as a public resource is a well-established fact. Ohio is an economically important and diverse state with strong manufacturing and agricultural industries that depend upon abundant and clean water. Ohio’s economy also depends upon the tourism that its waters attract. The program ensures that Ohio’s streams, rivers and lakes can be used for purposes such as industrial and agricultural production, boating, fishing, swimming and as a source of drinking water. The public’s expectations regarding clean water supplies and recreational opportunities would be placed in jeopardy without these standards and the programs that ensure regulated activities are able to meet them.

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

7. How will the Agency measure the success of this regulation in terms of outputs and/or outcomes?

Success can be measured in two ways: 1) tracking various administrative milestones in the programs that implement the water quality standards; and 2) monitoring the conditions of streams, rivers and lakes over time. The NPDES permit program and the 401 program routinely provide data and annual reports that describe the compliance performance of the regulated community. The Agency sets targets for achieving compliance with permit terms and conditions.

As described in the response to question #11, the water quality standards regulations are performance-based expectations regarding the quality of Ohio's surface water. Ohio EPA measures the success of the State's overall pollution control efforts through biological and chemical monitoring that determines whether or not a water body is attaining its designated uses. The status or health of Ohio's streams, rivers and lakes is reported every two years in the Integrated Water Quality Monitoring and Assessment Report, which is available on Ohio EPA's website at: <https://epa.ohio.gov/divisions-and-offices/surface-water/reports-data/ohio-integrated-water-quality-monitoring-and-assessment-report>.

8. Are any of the proposed rules contained in this rule package being submitted pursuant to R.C. 101.352, 101.353, 106.032, 121.93, or 121.931?

If yes, please specify the rule number(s), the specific R.C. section requiring this submission, and a detailed explanation.

No.

Development of the Regulation

9. Please list the stakeholders included by the Agency in the development or initial review of the draft regulation.

If applicable, please include the date and medium by which the stakeholders were initially contacted.

Ohio EPA sent electronic notification to DSW's rulemaking interested party list and posted the Early Stakeholder Outreach fact sheet on DSW's website on November 4, 2022. The comment period deadline was November 18, 2022. Approximately 2,600 interested parties were contacted via email; a list of recipients is available upon request.

10. What input was provided by the stakeholders, and how did that input affect the draft regulation being proposed by the Agency?

The Agency received one comment during the Early Stakeholder Outreach comment period, from Midwest Biodiversity Institute (MBI). MBI's comments focused on the Mill Creek basin, and pointed out that they have submitted data for streams in the basin to Ohio EPA's Credible Data Program for over ten years. The submitted data for Mill Creek have not been approved by our Credible Data Program due to staffing, time, and resource limitations. Currently, Ohio EPA is choosing to move forward with no changes to these rules, with the understanding that when Mill Creek data are verified as credible, we will move forward with a rulemaking.

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

During the Interested Party Review, we received comments on this rule from four parties. City of Cleveland/Cleveland Airport System suggested a stream use designation change in a segment of Abram Creek from warmwater habitat to modified warmwater habitat. We are considering making this change in the future, but we are waiting on new survey data before making the determination, so we do not plan to make this change at this time. MBI submitted similar comments to their ESO comments, our response was as before, see above. Cleveland Metroparks and Rocky River Watershed Council suggested stream name revisions in rule - 20, which we have implemented in the rule draft because they were supported by the federal GNIS naming database conventions. Because rules being amended cannot be filed with no change rules, rule -20 has been moved to a different rule package.

11. What scientific data was used to develop the rule or the measurable outcomes of the rule? How does this data support the regulation being proposed?

Methods Ohio EPA uses for water quality standards come from 40 C.F.R. 136 and are a result of years of research through laboratories across the nation, which are approved by US EPA. The documents listed in rule OAC 3745-1-03 provide the methods used to measure compliance with the criteria and other measurable outcomes regarding attainment of beneficial uses.

12. What alternative regulations (or specific provisions within the regulation) did the Agency consider, and why did it determine that these alternatives were not appropriate? If none, why didn't the Agency consider regulatory alternatives?
Alternative regulations may include performance-based regulations, which define the required outcome, but do not dictate the process the regulated stakeholders must use to comply.

None. The Agency reviewed the existing use designations and determined that revisions were not necessary based upon new biological and water quality survey results.

13. What measures did the Agency take to ensure that this regulation does not duplicate an existing Ohio regulation?

Ohio EPA is the delegated state agency for the water quality standards program. Only a review of existing Ohio EPA rules was necessary, and no duplication was found.

14. Please describe the Agency's plan for implementation of the regulation, including any measures to ensure that the regulation is applied consistently and predictably for the regulated community.

The Agency will put the effective date of the adopted rules three months out from the date of adoption, which provides for U.S. EPA's review and approval and gives the Agency time to update web pages and permit writing tools.

Adverse Impact to Business

15. Provide a summary of the estimated cost of compliance with the rule. Specifically, please do the following:

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

- a. **Identify the scope of the impacted business community; and**
- b. **Identify the nature of all adverse impact (e.g., fees, fines, employer time for compliance,); and**
- c. **Quantify the expected adverse impact from the regulation.**
The adverse impact can be quantified in terms of dollars, hours to comply, or other factors; and may be estimated for the entire regulated population or for a “representative business.” Please include the source for your information/estimated impact.

The water quality standards affect the business community indirectly through other regulatory programs that are designed to assure compliance with requirements based on meeting the water quality standards. These requirements take the form of effluent limits imposed by Ohio EPA through the NPDES permit program and the terms and conditions imposed through the 401 program for any activity that places dredge or fill materials into waters of the state. Though there is no direct cost associated with this water quality standards rulemaking, the Agency has evaluated potential costs the business community might incur through other CWA programs.

- a. The impacted business community might include those regulated through the NPDES program or Section 401 water quality certification.
- b. The nature of the adverse impact for those regulated through the NPDES program is the level of wastewater treatment necessary to meet the narrative and numeric criteria associated with the designated beneficial uses listed in the rules. The nature of the adverse impact for those regulated through the Section 401 water quality certification program is whether a proposed impact to the stream is approvable, and if approvable, the level of required compensatory mitigation.
- c. In regard to those regulated through the NPDES permit program, the overall adverse impact can vary greatly based on stream designated use, as the type and quantity of pollutants discharged, the amount of dilution water available to mix with the discharge, and the amounts of pollutants already present in the dilution water. A higher level of wastewater treatment may be required of those discharging to a higher quality stream.

In regard to those regulated through the Section 401 water quality certification program, the overall adverse impact can also vary greatly based on a stream’s designated use. A proposed project to impact higher quality streams is less likely to be approved and would require more compensatory mitigation than a project proposing to impact a lower quality stream.

For this rulemaking, there won’t be any impact as no changes are being put forward.

16. Are there any proposed changes to the rules that will reduce a regulatory burden imposed on the business community? Please identify. (*Reductions in regulatory burden may include streamlining reporting processes, simplifying rules to improve readability, eliminating requirements, reducing compliance time or fees, or other related factors*).
There are no proposed changes to these rules at this time.

17. Why did the Agency determine that the regulatory intent justifies the adverse impact to the regulated business community?

Clean water is recognized as a valued resource worth protecting. The water quality standards program and these draft rule revisions are the primary means of ensuring that the quality of water in Ohio's streams, rivers and lakes is improved, maintained and remains suitable for swimming, drinking and fishing. The basic goal of meeting all beneficial uses and criteria established under the CWA is the normal requirement mandated by federal regulations. Deviation from that expectation is allowed in only a handful of extraordinary circumstances, one of which is imposition of widespread social and economic impact. Thus, it is incumbent upon states to establish the proper balance between the water quality goals (beneficial uses and criteria) and the costs to society of attaining those goals. The Agency believes the draft rules are supported by the need to protect water quality and are in the overall public interest.

Regulatory Flexibility

18. Does the regulation provide any exemptions or alternative means of compliance for small businesses? Please explain.

Yes. Flexibility has been built into certain aspects of the water quality standards program. This flexibility applies to businesses of all sizes. Ohio's system of beneficial uses accounts for environmental and landscape factors in setting the tiered aquatic life use and the associated performance-based water quality criteria. In short, the tiered aquatic life uses provide a hierarchy of stream performance measures (biological and chemical water quality criteria) ranging from exceptional quality waters to highly modified waters that cannot fully support the "fishable" goals of the CWA. This system ensures that businesses, through the terms of their NPDES discharge permits, are required to meet limits that most closely match the actual water quality requirements that protect the aquatic environment in their immediate location. In other words, Ohio standards do not impose a one-size fits all mandate.

19. How will the agency apply Ohio Revised Code section 119.14 (waiver of fines and penalties for paperwork violations and first-time offenders) into implementation of the regulation?

The first-time paperwork violation waiver is not applicable to this rule package. The rules in OAC Chapter 3745-1 contain standards for CWA permitting programs to enforce. No paperwork or permits are required by the standards themselves.

20. What resources are available to assist small businesses with compliance of the regulation?

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov

- Ohio EPA Division of Environmental and Financial Assistance's Office of Compliance Assistance and Pollution Prevention (OCAPP) is a non-regulatory program that provides information and resources to help small businesses comply with environmental regulations. OCAPP also helps customers identify and implement pollution prevention measures that can save money, increase business performance and benefit the environment. Services of the office include a toll-free hotline, on-site compliance and pollution prevention assessments, workshops/training, plain-English publications library and assistance in completing permit application forms. Additional information is available at: epa.ohio.gov/divisions-and-offices/environmental-financial-assistance/about-defa/office-of-compliance-assistance-and-pollution-prevention.
- Ohio EPA also has a Customer Support Center web page (ohioepa.custhelp.com/) that contains links to several items to help businesses navigate the permit process, including the Permit Wizard, Frequently Asked Questions (FAQ), training and subscription to various program listservs.
- Ohio EPA maintains the Compliance Assistance Hotline 800-329-7518, weekdays from 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.
- Ohio EPA, Division of Environmental and Financial Assistance's Compliance Assistance Unit provides technical support to small (less than 0.5 million gallons per day) wastewater treatment plants. Additional information is available at: epa.ohio.gov/divisions-and-offices/environmental-financial-assistance/compliance-assistance/compliance-assistance.
- U.S. EPA Small Business Gateway also has information on environmental regulations for small businesses available at: epa.gov/smallbusiness/ and a Small Business Ombudsman Hotline 800-368-5888.
- U.S. EPA's Water Quality Standards Handbook, Second Edition available at: water.epa.gov/scitech/swguidance/standards/handbook/index.cfm.
- U.S. EPA's Policy and Guidance: Reference Library contains an index of EPA documents related to water quality standards, including those referenced in the WQS Handbook. You can sort the index alphabetically, by publication date, or by topic. Available at: water.epa.gov/scitech/swguidance/standards/library/index.cfm.
- The Division of Surface Water's Water Quality Standards program web page contains background information and direct links to sections of the regulations. Additional information is available at: epa.ohio.gov/divisions-and-offices/surface-water/reports-data/water-quality-standards-program.

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

CSIPublicComments@governor.ohio.gov