**ACTION:** No Change



### DATE: 01/31/2024 11:05 AM Common Sense Initiative

Mike DeWine, Governor Jon Husted, Lt. Governor Joseph Baker, Director

### **Business Impact Analysis**

Agency, Board, or Commission Name: <u>Ohio Department of Agriculture</u>
Rule Contact Name and Contact Information: <u>Renee Schmauch</u> Renee.Schmauch@agri.ohio.gov_614-728-6295
Regulation/Package Title (a general description of the rules' substantive content):
Species varanus komodoensis (komodo dragon)- Five Year Rule Review Rule Number(s):901:1-4-07
Xuit ((i))
Date of Submission for CSI Review: <u>12/5/2023</u>
Public Comment Period End Date: <u>12/27/2023</u>
Rule Type/Number of Rules:
New/rulesNo Change/1 rule (FYR? 1)Amended/rules (FYR?)Rescinded/rules (FYR?)

The Common Sense Initiative is established in R.C. 107.61 to eliminate excessive and duplicative rules and regulations that stand in the way of job creation. Under the Common Sense Initiative, agencies must balance the critical objectives of regulations that have an adverse impact on business with the costs of compliance by the regulated parties. Agencies should promote transparency, responsiveness, predictability, and flexibility while developing regulations that are fair and easy to follow. Agencies should prioritize compliance over punishment, and to that end, should utilize plain language in the development of regulations.

#### 77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

#### **Reason for Submission**

1. R.C. 106.03 and 106.031 require agencies, when reviewing a rule, to determine whether the rule has an adverse impact on businesses as defined by R.C. 107.52. If the agency determines that it does, it must complete a business impact analysis and submit the rule for CSI review.

Which adverse impact(s) to businesses has the agency determined the rule(s) create?

The rule(s):

- a. 🛛 Requires a license, permit, or any other prior authorization to engage in or operate a line of business.
- **b.** Imposes a criminal penalty, a civil penalty, or another sanction, or creates a cause of action for failure to comply with its terms.
- c. Requires specific expenditures or the report of information as a condition of compliance.
- d. 
  Is likely to directly reduce the revenue or increase the expenses of the lines of business to which it will apply or applies.

#### **Regulatory Intent**

#### 2. Please briefly describe the draft regulation in plain language. Please include the key provisions of the regulation as well as any proposed amendments.

On September 5, 2012, R.C. Chapter 935 became effective. Commonly referred to as the Dangerous Wild Animal and Restricted Snake Act which regulates the possession of dangerous wild animals and restricted snakes in the state of Ohio. Chapter 901:1-4 of the Administrative Code was established pursuant to R.C. §935.17.

The rules in this chapter set forth regulatory requirements to protect the public from the dangers posed by the possession of dangerous wild animals and restricted snakes, as well as to ensure the care for these animals. The protection includes mandating the use of safe housing, ensuring owners have the requisite knowledge to care for the animals, appropriate recordkeeping, and adequate sanitary conditions to prevent the spread of disease and infection. The rules have been reviewed pursuant to the five-year rule review requirements and are being proposed as follows:

901:1-4-07 establishes species care standards for komodo dragons. This rule has been proposed as needing no changes.

3. Please list the Ohio statute(s) that authorize the agency, board or commission to adopt the rule(s) and the statute(s) that amplify that authority.

ORC 935.17, 935.04, 935.12, 935.24,

4. Does the regulation implement a federal requirement? Is the proposed regulation being adopted or amended to enable the state to obtain or maintain approval to administer and enforce a federal law or to participate in a federal program? *If yes, please briefly explain the source and substance of the federal requirement.* 

No

5. If the regulation implements a federal requirement, but includes provisions not specifically required by the federal government, please explain the rationale for exceeding the federal requirement.

Not Applicable

6. What is the public purpose for this regulation (i.e., why does the Agency feel that there needs to be any regulation in this area at all)?

The Department is statutorily responsible for establishing rules which protect public safety and to promote animal welfare for registered dangerous wild animals. R.C. § 935.17. In R.C. § 935.17(B), the General Assembly set forth requirements that the rules "shall govern at least sanitation for, provision of health care for, and feeding, caging, housing, and fencing of dangerous wild animals. [In developing such rules] the Director [of the Department] shall consider [...] (2) Public health and safety; [...] (7) Standards adopted by the association of zoos and aquariums; (8) Standards adopted by the zoological association of America; (9) Standards established in the federal animal welfare act; and (10) Ethical standards established by the American veterinary medical association." The Department has been further required to establish permits for possession of dangerous wild animals and restricted snakes and effective means of maintaining facilities for possession of such animals, including informing local law enforcement of their presence and emergency plans in the event of their escape. Without regulations, an entity or individual may not provide the proper housing and care of the dangerous wild animal or restricted snake which can lead to escape and cause duress to the animal and put local law enforcement in a compromised position without information if such an escape were to occur.

## 7. How will the Agency measure the success of this regulation in terms of outputs and/or outcomes?

The Department will measure success by the number of complaints received and the results of any inspections conducted because of received complaints. Further, successful implementation of these rules should help to greatly reduce any chance for an animal to threaten public safety through escape by regulating the appropriate housing and care for these animals, as well as provide needed information to those in the community of their presence.

## 8. Are any of the proposed rules contained in this rule package being submitted pursuant to R.C. 101.352, 101.353, 106.032, 121.93, or 121.931? If yes, please specify the rule number(s), the specific R.C. section requiring this submission, and a detailed explanation. No

**Development of the Regulation** 

9. Please list the stakeholders included by the Agency in the development or initial review of the draft regulation.

## If applicable, please include the date and medium by which the stakeholders were initially contacted.

On September 27, 2023, the following stakeholders were emailed a copy of the proposed rules and the comment period remained open until October 11, 2023. These stakeholders represent statewide organizations and individuals with an interest in the division of Animal Health rules.

#### Organization

Anderholm Veterinary Clinic Animal Medical & Surgical Center Animal Welfare Institute Animals Unlimited Veterinary Hospital Barnesville-Woodsfield Veterinary Service LLC **Byland Animal Hospital** Celina Animal Hospital, Inc. **Claremont Vet Clinic** Coldwater Animal Clinic/ Ft Recovery **Columbus Dog Connection** Country Roads Veterinary Services **Darke County Health Commisioner** Crank and Kirkpatrick Animal Hospital **Danville Veterinary Clinic Danville Veterinary Clinic Delaware Equine LLC Diamond M Veterinary Clinic Environmental Defense Fund** East Holmes Vet Clinic East Holmes Vet Clinic East Holmes Vet Clinic Environmental Law & Policy Center Fayette Veterinary Hospital Green Camp Vet Clinic Healthy Pets of Wedgewood Hillsboro Veterinary Hospital Humane Society of the United States Karr Veterinary Clinic Kolehmainen Veterinary Clinic Lisbon Vet Clinic Inc Masterson Veterinary Clinic MedVet Columbus

#### Contact

Anderholm, Constance Darr, Cathrine Craig, Adrienne Anderson, Valerie

Miesse, Craig Kaeser, Donald R Seger, Urban Defrischia, Kelly Brennan, David T Terrence Holman, DVM

Webb, L. Jarrod Hoxworth, Teresa Chase, James P Kearns, Earnest Karen Champan Shaver, Eric M Wise, Aaron Mierzwiak, Kristen Madeline Fleisher

Forshey, Melissa

Corey Roscoe Karr, Paul E Kolehmainen, William J Schmucker, Gordon Masterson, Rhonda

77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

Mogadore Vet Hospital
Mt Hope Vet Services,
Walnut Creek Veterinary Clinic
Northgate Animal Hospital
Ohio Animal Welfare Federation
Ohio Beef Council/Ohio Cattlemen's Association
Ohio Belgian Breeders Association
Ohio Dairy Producers
Ohio Dairy Veterinarians
Ohio County Dog Warden's Association
Ohio Ecological Food and Farm Association
Ohio Farm Bureau
Ohio Farmers Union
Ohio Farmers Union
Ohio Forum for Companion Animals
Ohio Haflinger Association
Ohio Harness Horsemen's Association
Ohio Percheron Breeders Association
Ohio Pork Producers Council
Ohio Poultry Association
Ohio Quarter Horse Association
Ohio Soil and Water Conservation Commission
Ohio Soybean Association
Ohio State University
Ohio Veterinarian Medical Association
Ohio Veterinarian Medical Association
Ohio Veterinarian Medical Association
Ohio Welsh Pony Association
Paw Patch Veterinary Services
Pondview Veterinary Clinic
Pondview Veterinary Clinic
Shawnee Animal Clinic
Shelby Animal Clinic

Stonyridge Veterinary Service

Varga, Joseph Gibson, Douglas **Colleen Evans Elizabeth Harsh** Carolyn Piergallini Scott Higgins Dr. Gabe Middleton Barb Knapp Amalie Lipstreu Adam Sharp Jack Irvin Larry Antosh Leah Curtis Roger High **Tony Seegers** Yvonne Lesicko Joe Logan Linda Borton Leon Beachy Lucy Workman **Renee Mancino** Darlena Chettle Cheryl Day Jim Chakeres Scott Myers **Tom Price** Brandon Kern Dr. Tom Wittum Adam Ward Jack Advent R. David Frash

Whittington, David

Paul Hurd Hirt, Laurie Dougherty, Patrick Small, Tasha Nichole Sherman, Angela Knox, John W Eisenberg, Eric

#### 77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic The Ohio State University The Ohio State University The Ohio State University The Ohio State University The Plains Veterinary Hospital, LLC **Twin Valley Animal Hospital Twinsburg Vet Hospital** USDA – APHIS VS Wellington Veterinary Clinic Westside Animal Clinic Wheelersburg Animal Hospital Inc. Willard Veterinary Clinic **OEMA** OEPA ODNR DOW

**USDA APHIS WS** United Producer's Inc DHI Cooperative, Inc Aquaculture Anderholm Veterinary Clinic Animal Medical & Surgical Center Animals Unlimited Veterinary Hospital ASPCA Barnesville-Woodsfield Veterinary Service LLC The Batchelder Company **Burroughs Veterinary Services Byland Animal Hospital Capitol Advocates Capitol Consulting** Celina Animal Hospital, Inc. **Claremont Vet Clinic** Coldwater Animal Clinic/ Ft Recovery Columbiana County Dog Warden **Country Roads Veterinary Services** Crank And Kirkpatrick Animal Hospital **Danville Veterinary Clinic Delaware Equine LLC** 

Donley, Shane Honigford, James Clay, Aimee Dr. Tom Wittum Dr. Rustin Moore Dr. Jeanette O'Quinn Peggy Hall Ryan, Ericka Twin Valley Animal Hospital Lozanoff, Stacy Dr. Roger Krogwold Spreng, William A Ayars, William

Brad Schwartz Alison Shockley Kendra Wecker Mike Tonkovich Andy Monteney Mike Bumgarner Brian Winters Dan Longnecker Anderholm, Constance Darr, Cathrine Anderson, Valerie

Judy, Troy Burroughs, Mark Steven

Rob Eshenbaugh Belinda Jones Miesse, Craig Kaeser, Donald R Seger, Urban

Brennan, David T

Hoxworth, Teresa Chase, James P

#### 77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

**Diamond M Veterinary Clinic Environmental Defense Fund** East Holmes Vet Clinic East Holmes Vet Clinic East Holmes Vet Clinic **Environmental Law & Policy Center** Fayette Veterinary Hospital Green Camp Vet Clinic Greenfield Vet Healthy Pets of Wedgewood Heritage Veterinary Care Hillsboro Veterinary Hospital **Hocking Hills Animal Clinic** Holmes County Dog Warden Humane Society of the United States Karr Veterinary Clinic **Knox County Dog Warden Kolehmainen Veterinary Clinic** Lisbon Vet Clinic Inc Little Puppies Online LLC Masterson Veterinary Clinic MedVet Columbus Mogadore Vet Hospital Mt Hope Vet Services, Walnut Creek Veterinary Clinic Napoleon Veterinary Clinic Northgate Animal Hospital **Ohio Animal Welfare Federation** Ohio Beef Council/Ohio Cattlemen's Association **Ohio Belgian Breeders Association Ohio Dairy Producers** Ohio County Dog Warden's Association Ohio Ecological Food and Farm Association **Ohio Farm Bureau Ohio Farmers Union Ohio Farmers Union** 

Kearns, Earnest Karen Champan Shaver, Eric M Wise, Aaron Mierzwiak, Kristen Madeline Fleisher Forshey, Melissa Sims, Michael Shannon Moore **Corey Roscoe** Karr, Paul E John Carhart Kolehmainen, William J Schmucker, Gordon Nathan Bazler Masterson, Rhonda Whittington, David Varga, Joseph Gibson, Douglas Colleen Evans **Elizabeth Harsh Carolyn Piergallini** Scott Higgins Barb Knapp Amalie Lipstreu Adam Sharp Jack Irvin Larry Antosh Leah Curtis Roger High **Tony Seegers** Joe Logan Linda Borton

#### 77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

**Ohio Forum for Companion Animals Ohio Haflinger Association** Ohio Harness Horsemen's Association **Ohio Percheron Breeders Association Ohio Pork Producers Council Ohio Poultry Association** Ohio Quarter Horse Association Ohio State University **Ohio Veterinarian Medical Association Ohio Veterinarian Medical Association Ohio Welsh Pony Association Paw Patch Veterinary Services** Petco **Pondview Veterinary Clinic Pondview Veterinary Clinic Premier Pups LLC** Shawnee Animal Clinic Shelby Animal Clinic Sierra Club, Ohio Chapter Stonyridge Veterinary Service Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic The Ohio State University The Ohio State University The Plains Veterinary Hospital, LLC **Tuscarawas County Dog Warden** Twin Valley Animal Hospital **Twinsburg Vet Hospital** USDA – APHIS USDA - APHIS Walnut Hills Vet Wayne County Dog Warden Wellington Veterinary Clinic Westside Animal Clinic Wheelersburg Animal Hospital Inc. Willard Veterinary Clinic Your New Puppy Hocking Hills Animal Clinic **Commercial Dog Breeder Advisory Board** 

Leon Beachy Lucy Workman Renee Mancino **Darlena Chettle Bryan Humphreys** Jim Chakeres Scott Myers Adam Ward Jack Advent **R.** David Frash Paul Hurd Hirt, Laurie Mike Gonidakis Dougherty, Patrick Small, Tasha Nichole Michael Schoeff Sherman, Angela Knox, John W Adam Rissien Eisenberg, Eric Daugherty, Rick Donley, Shane Honigford, James Sugarcreek Veterinary Clinic Dr. Jeanette O'Quinn Peggy Hall Ryan, Ericka

Lozanoff, Stacy Dr. Roger Crogwold Dr. Susan Skorupski Mark Parker

Spreng, William A Ayars, William

Mark Johnson Shannon Moore Matt Granito

#### 77 SOUTH HIGH STREET | 30TH FLOOR | COLUMBUS, OHIO 43215-6117

Commercial Dog Breeder Advisory Board Country Road Veterinary Services Town and Country Veterinary Clinic Orrville Veterinary Clinic Linda Stickney Lisa Zimmerman Lori Carlson Dr. Micheal Frederick Dr. Patricia Haynes Dr. Dennis Trautwein Dr. Greg Price Dr. Gabe Middleton

## 10. What input was provided by the stakeholders, and how did that input affect the draft regulation being proposed by the Agency?

The Department emailed the stakeholders listed above a copy of the rules and gave them an opportunity to comment. No comments were received.

## 11. What scientific data was used to develop the rule or the measurable outcomes of the rule? How does this data support the regulation being proposed?

The rules were developed using the best available data from veterinarians and experts in the care of dangerous wild animals. Standards from third-party organizations, when applicable, were used as a starting point in the original development of these rules.

# 12. What alternative regulations (or specific provisions within the regulation) did the Agency consider, and why did it determine that these alternatives were not appropriate? If none, why didn't the Agency consider regulatory alternatives? *Alternative regulations may include performance-based regulations, which define the required outcome, but do not dictate the process the regulated stakeholders must use to comply.*

The Department is statutorily responsible for establishing rules which protect public safety and to promote animal welfare for registered dangerous wild animals, R.C. § 935.17. Lack of stakeholder participation in this rule package has indicated to the Department that this is the best regulatory scheme at this time. For those reasons, no other regulatory alternatives were considered.

## 13. What measures did the Agency take to ensure that this regulation does not duplicate an existing Ohio regulation?

The Department is the sole regulator for those possessing or propagating dangerous wild animals except for a few specific permits issued by the Ohio Department of Natural Resources that apply only to indigenous species.

14. Please describe the Agency's plan for implementation of the regulation, including any measures to ensure that the regulation is applied consistently and predictably for the regulated community.

These rules are well understood by the regulated community and the Department works with all permit holders and those involved in animal industries to educate and inform them on the safety regulations. The staff members of the Animal Health Division ensure that all permit holders are treated in a similar manner.

#### **Adverse Impact to Business**

- 15. Provide a summary of the estimated cost of compliance with the rule(s). Specifically, please do the following:
  - a. Identify the scope of the impacted business community, and All dangerous wild animal and restricted snake permit holders.
  - b. Quantify and identify the nature of all adverse impact (e.g., fees, fines, employer time for compliance, etc.).

The adverse impact can be quantified in terms of dollars, hours to comply, or other factors; and may be estimated for the entire regulated population or for a representative business. Please include the source for your information/estimated impact.

These rules focus on the housing and care of dangerous wild animals; requirements which permit holders must comply with or be refused the proper permits. Permit holders will need to spend time ensuring their current housing of their dangerous wild animals or restricted snakes meet the requirements of the regulations, time and money checking and repairing housing, time making certain that feeding and care standards are met, and time ensuring that local law enforcement officials are aware of the animals in their possession and that they have a plan in the event of escape or emergency. The possession or propagation of a dangerous wild animal or restricted snake without the proper permit can result in civil or criminal penalties. Violators of the rules pay fines and may have permits suspended or revoked. As specified by the statute, one must provide proof of current insurance coverage or bond to cover any injuries or damages due to the escape or other actions of the animals.

The exact adverse impact varies widely for each permit holder or applicant due to the diverse nature of the animals regulated by these rules and the varying individual circumstances of each permit holder. When possible, the rules were written to be outcome based and allow the permit holder a great deal of flexibility and personal choice in determining how to meet the standards. The cost of permits is low, especially when compared to the cost to feed and house the given number of dangerous wild animals and restricted snakes that may be in a permit holder's possession. The hours a permit holder would spend cleaning housing and ensuring the housing and current care is to specifications in the rules would depend on which type and how many animals the permit holder possesses.

16. Are there any proposed changes to the rules that will <u>reduce</u> a regulatory burden imposed on the business community? Please identify. *(Reductions in regulatory burden may include streamlining reporting processes, simplifying rules to improve readability, eliminating requirements, reducing compliance time or fees, or other related factors).* 

## 17. Why did the Agency determine that the regulatory intent justifies the adverse impact to the regulated business community?

As mentioned above, the General Assembly mandated that the Department develop rules to protect the safety of the general public and welfare of the regulated animals. The Department has worked with the public to minimize, where possible, the economic impacts of these rules. While the protections offered by the rules to the public, the regulated community, and animals are significant, the adverse impact caused by the rules has been limited when possible.

#### **Regulatory Flexibility**

## **18.** Does the regulation provide any exemptions or alternative means of compliance for small businesses? Please explain.

The law expressly prohibits many of the business activities associated with these animals by making it illegal to buy, sell, or transfer many dangerous wild animals. The Department has made many changes to enclosure sizes to accommodate animals that are housed indoors by private owners and businesses. The proposed rules also provide a separate housing standard for small alligators and crocodiles.

## 19. How will the agency apply Ohio Revised Code section 119.14 (waiver of fines and penalties for paperwork violations and first-time offenders) into implementation of the regulation?

The Department is primarily concerned with protecting public safety and animal health through compliance with these rules. Whenever possible, the Department will treat administrative violations that do not involve public safety or animal health as opportunities for improvement through warning notices and solicitation of corrective actions. Harsher enforcement options will be reserved for offenders who do not cooperate or those that have repeated violations.

## 20. What resources are available to assist small businesses with compliance of the regulation?

The Department is always available to assist small businesses with compliance. The Department currently has a website devoted to dangerous wild animals and restricted snakes that contains helpful information about this statute, including the rules. The Department will also be in direct communication with all permit holders and applicants, and will work to provide them with all available information and resources, whether by phone, email, or letter.

No